

Running head: CELLPHONES FOR HEALTH IN SOUTH AFRICA

Cellphones for health: An exploration  
of interventions in South Africa  
Tanja Bosch  
University of Cape Town  
Draft 1: June 30, 2008

### Abstract

There is global use of technology in medicine and health communication, leading to terms such as telemedicine, telehealth and e-health. A wide range of information and communication technologies (ICTs) has been used both in the provision of services, as well as in messaging and communication campaigns. In South Africa limited internet penetration has led to more experimentation with cellphones. This paper provides a discussion of these projects, focusing on: The Teen SMS Helpline of the South African Depression and Anxiety Group; SIMPill which assists with compliance to tuberculosis medication; and CellLife's Cellphones for HIV programme. The projects are described, with reflection on the possibilities for the uses of cellphones in healthcare, weighing advantages and disadvantages, particularly in the local context.

## Cellphones for health in South Africa

### Introduction

The global trend of using new technologies in healthcare and health communication has made its way to Africa. A range of healthcare initiatives makes use of palm devices, the internet, and other information and communication technologies, giving rise to the terms e-health (see Oh et al, 2005, for a literature review on the topic), tele-health, and telemedicine.

While the growing body of literature on this subject explores both the Internet and cellphones as 'new' media in the use of health promotion efforts, it is cellphones that are emerging as most popular, and possibly most effective, in health communication in the continent. Internet penetration in South Africa is increasing steadily, but the numbers of people with access to high-speed internet connectivity here and elsewhere across Africa are probably still too low to allow the widespread success of internet based applications, outside of telecentres set up specifically for this purpose. Recent statistics indicate that only one in 700 Africans has access to the internet, versus one in four Europeans (Chakraborty, 2008).

On the other hand, the number of mobile subscribers in Africa has increased dramatically over the last few years. In 2007 Africa added over 60 million new mobile subscribers and mobile phones represented 90 percent of all telephone subscribers (African Telecommunication/ICT Indicators, 2008). Indeed, cellphone penetration in Africa has increased rapidly since the privatization of telephone monopolies in the mid-1990s (LaFraniere, 2005). Between 2000 and 2006, the total number of subscribers to cellphone services increased from 10 million to 110 million, in the 24 countries of sub-Saharan Africa, and South Africa had more subscribers to cellphones than fixed lines (Buys, et al, 2008). Similarly, an earlier study revealed that the number of mobile subscribers in 30 Sub-Saharan countries rose from zero in 1994 to more than 82 million in late 2004 and the rate of growth for the entire continent has been more than 58% per year (Mbarika, 2006).

Clearly, Sub-Saharan Africa is the world's fastest-growing wireless market and the rate of growth for the entire continent has been more than 58% per year (Mbarika, 2006). In South Africa, cellphone use is widespread, particular with the introduction of pre-paid services; and there are over 30 million users (Shackleton, 2007).

Using Kaplan's (2006) definition of intervention to mean the intentional use of cellphones to achieve a specific health-related outcome, this paper surveys past and present cellphone interventions in South Africa, drawing on an extensive literature search and qualitative interviews with project leaders. There is an extensive array of literature on a range of projects using cellphones in health communication (see McBride & Rimer, 1999, who provide a literature review), but there is little literature documenting such projects in Africa. Furthermore, in South Africa, the idea of cellphones for development (including health) is not new, but while there are some disparate articles on specific projects, there is little scholarly work on the subject.

This article thus provides an overview of the area of cellphones for health in South Africa, with detailed discussions of three of the largest and/ or longest running projects: The Teen SMS Line of the South African Depression and Anxiety Group (SADAG); The Cellphones for HIV project run by CellLife; and SIMPill, previously known as the TB Compliance Project.

#### Background: Cellphones in South Africa

As a result of widespread penetration, cellphones have been widely used across Africa for a number of applications. In various countries including Kenya, Senegal (Mbarika, 2006) and Sierre Leone (The Economist, 2008), they've been used for political activism, where citizens can report ballot fraud via SMS. Cellphones have also proven useful for isolated

communities to participate in the global economy e.g. farmers in Uganda have used cellphones to find out about the latest crop prices (Gray, 2006).

In South Africa, cellphones are already used quite prolifically for a number of applications. Students in their final year of school can access their final school year results by SMS as part of a service offered by the Department of Education. A project called the Mobile Dictionary (MobiDic) allows users to access dictionary entries via their phones, sending definitions of words by return SMS; the Department of Home Affairs department is piloting a system which allows citizens to receive SMS notifications on their cell phones regarding the status of their applications for passports and other documents. The organization *Abahlali baseMjondolo* has used mobile phones extensively as a way for people in settlements across the city to stay in touch to arrange meetings, share information and mobilize citizens for what they call 'cell phone toyi-toyi', where members SMS an official to request a meeting (Shackleton, 2007).

The *UmNyango Project*, based in KwaZulu Natal set up an SMS gateway to distribute messages to rural women and also allowed them to send messages to paralegals if they needed help with incidences of violence or threats to their access to land (Manji, 2008). With widespread access to cellphones and the introduction of more affordable options such as pay-as-you-go, South Africans use cellphones widely for a range of applications, from cellphone based online banking, to online chat systems such as MXit (see Bosch, 2008; Butgereit, 2007). Cellphones are also widely used to allow users to SMS monetary donations to NGOs.

The progression to using cellphones for health-related services seems natural, with this high saturation of the technology. Before this is explored further, a brief discussion of how cellphones are currently used in health applications in other parts of the world follows.

### International uses of cellphones for health

A considerable number of previous research studies have explored the uses of cell phones in various areas of health communication, most notably, assisting patients with adherence to treatment or serving as reminders to take medication. This article does not attempt to provide an exhaustive literature review, but merely presents a snapshot of some projects, to briefly provide a sense of the range of existing projects.

A pilot study in Indianapolis, United States, explored the possibilities of using cell phones to target youth right at the time they might be engaging in risky behaviour such as drinking or smoking (Health 24, 2008). The advantage of the medium is heavy teen use of cell phones, combined with the fact that they do not need to 'tune in' to traditional media such as radio or television public service announcements.

On the other end of the spectrum, HealthyToys.org, founded by a parental advocacy group and two American organisations, lets concerned parents text in the name of a toy they are considering buying in a shop and instantly reports back with information about lead or other toxins that may have been found in it.

In Peru and elsewhere, it was found that HIV positive people already use their cellphones (the alarm function) to remind them to take their medication, with 74% of their sample indicating a willingness to receive messages about sexual health via SMS (Curiosa & Kurth, 2007).

The use of cellphones for healthcare applications in Africa is similarly widespread. In Rwanda, the Manyange project uses cell phones for health workers to call up the records of pregnant women from an online database and then tell caregivers what to do in an emergency. Each Ericsson phone has a training manual on material and childcare with pictures and audio instructions that can be sent to families. Around 143 private and public health centres in Rwanda use *Tracnet*, a system that uses cellphones to collect information on patients'

infections, and to keep track of which medicines are available in each health centre, making shortages of ARVs less common (Kimani, 2008; Chakraborty, 2008).

Information about a polio outbreak in Kenya became available because health workers were using hand-held devices to collect survey data (The Economist, 2008).

Further, a recent (2008) edition of the Soul Beat (2008), a newsletter distributed by the Communication Initiative, profiled several initiatives currently underway in Africa. These include *MyQuestion and MyAnswer*, a Nigerian project which allows young people to request information on reproductive health and HIV/AIDS via SMS; a cellphone project in the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), set up to monitor and report on child rights violations; and the edutainment *Freedom HIV/AIDS Game* based in India and six African countries, among others.

With the exception of the latter, the majority of these applications make use of text messaging or SMS, although, as will be discussed below, there are other uses of cellphones in the field of health communication. While text messaging has been slow to rise in some markets (e.g. the United States), Goggin (2006) documents its widespread popularity in Japan and the Nordic countries. Text messaging is similarly popular in South Africa, particularly as it is much cheaper than voice calls. SMS thus has obvious advantages, most importantly its relatively low cost. Moreover, SMS messages can be sent when a user's cellphone is turned off (and can then be retrieved later), they are private; and it is already a widely diffused technology, meaning that there's no need to train participants to use the technology. But there are also some limitations: SMS messages are limited in the number of characters (160), illiterate participants cannot access them, and they do not promote interactivity or complex interpersonal feedback.

## Cellphones for health in South Africa

Several projects in South Africa have utilised various aspects of mobile telephony for health communication. Following international trends, most of these began with using cellphones to help patients with adherence to drug routines. For example, the Perinatal HIV Research Unit (PHRU) in Soweto conducted a pilot project with DocVia.com to provide drug and appointment reminders. Similarly, the Dokoza Project was piloted for six weeks over November and December 2004 at the HIV/AIDS Adult Clinic at the Helen Joseph Hospital and the Paediatric Clinic at Johannesburg General Hospital in Gauteng.

The aim of the piloted system was to fast-track the roll-out of anti-retroviral treatment (ART) in resource poor settings, with its capacity to collect and disseminate real time data (e.g. patient registration, obtaining patient medication history etc) and transaction information for patients receiving ART and TB treatments (White & Patel, 2005); as well as offering hospitals a common interface to the National Laboratory System to allow fast access to blood test results (Spur, 2005). This system was designed to allow for a range of real time updates, and it was anticipated that applications would extend to allow hospitals to use cellphones for national searches to track where patients are registered and when the latest medication was dispensed, or to provide instant feedback about possible duplication of services (White & Patel, 2005).

Similarly, a second pilot project, at Brits Hospital in the North West Province, was set up to address a current difficulty with managing patient numbers, resulting in patients, many of whom travel long distances, to be turned away because there is no mechanism for anticipating demand (White & Patel, 2005). A company called Mohwiti Technologies set up *AccessHealth*, for the Department of Health, which involves using cellphones to improve patient referrals between local clinics and district hospitals. Similarly, the UWC Project, is an ongoing pilot in the rural Eastern Cape involving the remote Canzibe Hospital and Lwandile



Clinic in Libode District. It operates using a long-range WiFi network, and WiFi enable smartphones in addition to mobile applications such as MXit, Skype and Fring, to cheaply enable communication between rural hospital doctors and clinic sisters – e.g. test results can be photographed and sent via the wireless network from the satellite clinics for instant analysis (Shackleton, 2007).

South Africa presents an interesting case study with its simultaneous high levels of diseases like HIV and TB and cellphone penetration. And as such, there seem to be some obvious possibilities for drawing links between these two trends. As the project manager of CellLife, an NGO who taps into this, says:

For the first time that I'm aware of, there's now an interactive digital technology, literally in the hands of the majority. So now most people in a township or remote rural area literally have one, which means you're close to 90% of people who have access to one through a family member neighbour etc and I doubt that's ever been the case before (Benjamin, interview, 14/6/08).

The following projects will be described in further detail below: The SADAG Teen SMS Helpline, SIMPill and CellLife. These were selected as they are the oldest and/ or longest running projects using cellphones in the country, and because of their perceived high levels of sustainability. All the other projects identified ran as pilot projects, with limited utility beyond their test period.

#### SADAG Teen SMS Helpline

The South African Depression and Anxiety Group (SADAG) launched an SMS project in 2000 to reach teens in crisis in an attempt to curb teen suicide. Teenagers send an SMS to the number 31393, and a counsellor replies to the message. According to the project director, Janine Shamos, the centre receives between 30 and 50 SMSes per day, and more during peak periods e.g. during stressful exam periods; and the content ranges quite widely, from seeking basic information to actually requesting counselling for very specific problems.

They ranged from things like “I think my daughter needs help” to “I’ve tried to kill myself 5 times, I hate my life. I want to die tonight, Please help me”. In that kind of a case obviously we would actually phone the person back. But we do get a wide range of different things coming on SMS. But the first point of contact from us would be to say thank you for contacting the centre, we got your message, please give us a call we can help you so much more if you phone us. Very often we’ll get someone SMS’ing back and saying I don’t have a landline or its too expensive and then we’d say to them would you like us to call you back and we will then, because if someone SMSes and says “Hi I’m looking for the nearest branch of alcoholics anonymous in my area”, fine we’ll send that to them on SMS, not a problem. But if someone calls and says “I want to kill my 3 children” we’re not going to risk it over SMS, we need that proper, face-to-face contact, we need that voice-to-voice contact (interview, Shamos, 23/6/08).

In this instance, the SMS line is used mainly as the first point of contact, and not for actual counselling. SADAG explained how the idea arose after a school programme called *Suicide Shouldn’t be a Secret*, where informational talks in schools in the Gauteng region were introduced as a response to the rise in teen suicide in South Africa. While teens posed lots of questions to the visiting counsellors after each talk, they seemed hesitant to call the centre’s toll-free line afterwards. According to Shamos, the centre then decided to introduce an SMS line, as it was felt to be an easier way to get teens to initiate contact.

A lot of people and particular kids – you know teens are so used to SMS’ing, it’s so second nature to them they’ve forgotten how to speak to people – it’s a lot easier to SMS a couple of times, get some feedback, get some reassurance that what they’re doing is the right thing, and then they’re happy to call us in. And we’ve found that definitely with the teen suicide programme (interview, Shamos, 23/6/08).

While originally started as a service to teens, the SMS line is also open to the general public. Texting is a widespread practice in South Africa, and the centre tapped into its popularity to encourage people in need of counselling to make the initial contact with the centre in a possibly less intimidating way than a telephone call. The almost impersonal nature and relative anonymity of the text message could potentially relieve the stress and embarrassment of direct voice contact with a stranger regarding emotional/ psychological

problems.

Remembering a 5-digit number is very, very easy, and people SMS because it's second nature. You're sitting watching TV, you've got your phone in your hand, it's much quicker. And what people have said back to us is that they want to test the waters a bit and see that someone is really there, so that if they do phone the phone is not going to just ring and ring, there is a human on the other end of the line who is waiting for their call and is going to take them seriously and once they know that that's there, then they're prepared to phone us back (interview, Shamos, 23/6/08).

The SMS line operates between normal toll-free line hours of 8am and 8pm, with counsellors on duty to respond immediately to messages or to call back in urgent cases, or when a potential patient does not have access to a landline. After hours, Shamos can access the SMS system from home via the Internet.

They are also exploring using the South African based instant chat system MXit, as well as online social networking programme Facebook, in a similar way. But Shamos stresses that the function of the SMS is merely to initiate contact; and that similarly, something like Facebook would only be used to create an online group and to give people enough information about mental illness so that they either feel less isolated or seek help directly from SADAG (or any other similar service providers). As such, text messages are used mainly to make them more accessible to people who might be afraid to call the centre directly. As Shamos explains,

Ethically we don't do counselling over SMS, it's just far too risky to all parties. But it is something that at least allows people first contact, and that's often the hardest part. Sometimes picking up a phone can be very very scary for them. So SMS kind of neutralises that fear a little bit, so we're quite happy with how it's working (interview, Shamos, 23/6/08).

#### SIMPill: Monitoring drug adherence

On the other hand, SIMPill operates purely as a commercial enterprise. The project was set up in 2001 as The Compliance Service, providing support for patients taking TB Treatment through SMS. Based in the Western Cape, it was designed to increase patient

compliance with TB drugs, as Cape Town has one of the highest TB infection rates in the world due to socio-economic and climatic factors; and in addition, a high rate of non-compliance, increasing the virus's resistance and wasting medicines. TB patients must strictly follow a complicated drug regime over an extended period of time, which they often neglect simply because they forget; and this non-compliance with the drug treatment has burdened local health care services (Gray, 2006).

Project director and medical doctor, David Green, partnered with the City of Cape Town to run a pilot project, which tested the use of cell phones to remind patients to take their medication, with a very high success rate (only 1 treatment failure out of the 138 participants). He explained that there was such a great demand for the technical capabilities that the company then expanded from being just the compliance project to an additional company called On-Cue (of which the former was a part). Today they form part of an even larger company called Neil Harvey Associates. Green explains that the project arose out of the concern to avoid sending spam or unwanted messages to patients.

One of the things that we discovered in On Cue is that sending people a message at least once a day and in the case of HIV twice or three times a day, irritates people. The novelty very quickly wears off and they develop what I call message fatigue. That is they know what the message is and it irritates them more than is helpful. So then I set about trying to work out how we could send them messages only when they need it, and then I developed SIMPill (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

SIMPill provides a special pill bottle that delivered an SMS to a central server when the bottle is opened, sends a message to a central server; and which can be programmed to send a message to the patient or to their support services e.g. family and friends, or community health workers (Verclas, 2007), if they don't open the pill bottle, based on the assumption that the patient has therefore not taken their medication. The service is currently offered to a number of TB and HIV patients around the country, and the project partners with government and a medical scheme. In this case, the costs exceed the price of simple SMS

message.

It's fairly expensive, the SIMPill bottle itself has a full radio frequency module in it, if we put all the screens and buttons on it, it'd be a fully functional cellphone, and there's no other way of doing it. And then there's sending the messages from the bottle and so on (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

SIMPill do not send unsolicited SMS messages, but Green says that they often 'flood' for a few days when a patient initiates therapy, as well as sending monthly messages, which include a call-centre number, to remind patients to pick up their medication refills.

If it's a newly diagnosed diabetic, for example, it might be information about why it's important to get eye care or look after your feet or take your medication. Once a week we send out humour, just a random joke, it's got nothing to do with anything, and then a reminder to take your medication; just to try and break the tedium and to try and get people to pick up their phone and look at it (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

The messages are run only in English, as a result of feedback from focus groups with speakers of other languages. Green believes that the success of the project is directly linked to their expansion as a commercial entity.

I can only reflect on why we've been successful, and this is going to sound really harsh, but it's partly because we shelved the social entrepreneur concept quite early on, and that's almost directly opposite to how *CellLife's* gone about it. But we said we're going to have to make good amounts of money and employ the right people and for that we have to make sure we can sell our product. So we've pursued a commercial path quite aggressively and that's allowed us to continue doing what we're doing (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

#### CellLife: Cellphones for HIV

While the commercial product SIMPill was found to be effective in assisting patients with their TB medication, assessment results were inconclusive in the utility of the system for HIV/AIDS projects. On the other hand, the NGO CellLife Project was set up specifically with HIV and AIDS in mind. Set up by researchers at the University of Cape Town, in conjunction with the Peninsula Technikon in 2000, the name comes from the idea that a cellphone or SMS could save your life. Specially tailored cellphones were programmed with a list of questions

which counsellors posed to HIV positive patients during home visits. The answers would then be sent via text message to a central database monitored by doctors and health workers, who could respond to urgent requests (Harrison, 2005).

Currently, there are two main elements to the project: Firstly, a software system (called CellLife) is used to assist with the dispensing of anti-retroviral drugs to people with Aids. As general manager, Peter Benjamin, explains:

It's a software system basically to manage the pharmacists, patients and prescriptions and stock levels and reporting that assists, particularly under-resourced clinics, to be able to dispense the ARVs. And that's currently in about 20 clinics, about 25 000 people get the drugs every month. It's currently in 5 different provinces...(interview, 14/6/08).

The organization, registered as a Section 21 non-profit company or NGO, still develops applications that use cellphone based software to replace paper questionnaires in the field. This is currently being used for an NGO called the Community Health Media Trust, whose trainers in the field use the system to return information about patients at their workshops.

The most interesting project that CellLife is currently embarking on is a 3-year pilot programme called Cellphones for HIV. The major premise behind this is quite revolutionary. Benjamin and his colleagues have been exploring ways to provide people with information at as low a cost as possible or free of charge, as well as to develop a system that will work on all handsets. Firstly, people will obviously have to opt-in to avoid sending spam SMS messages. Secondly, Benjamin's idea is that these people can send what's called a "Please Call Me", which is commonly used in South Africa and completely free. Instead of responding with the limited characters of an SMS, the response will be in the form of a public service announcement (PSA), which the user will retrieve from the voicemail box (checking voicemail is also free to South African subscribers).

What I was missing is something blindingly obvious- voicemail. Send it to their mailbox and the person does a normal check their voicemail. So how can you push the sound from here to here [from sender to user]. You can do a normal phone call but that's the normal cost of a phone call. WASP (wireless application service provider) 180 of them in the country – what these Wasps can do is to push via ftp a .wav file from the system to the voicemail and it's 45 cents for one minute. And I've done embarrassing things like stand in front of the bathroom mirror for 45 seconds to see how much you can say... You can get about ten times the amount of information than in a regular SMS. And also as you obviously know you can get so much feeling and information as a text is so boring. (Benjamin, interview, 14/6/08).

One aspect of this is a partnership with the entertainment-education radio and TV programme Soul City, which will allow listeners and viewers to send a 'please call me' at the end of the programmes, to give producers immediate feedback. Moreover, sending a message to a specific number will allow audio to be sent back in the language of your choice. This is particularly useful given that information on prevention is often most effective when it forms part of a larger multimedia campaign (Shackleton, 2007). CellLife will also be using a similar system in another project which will be run in conjunction with the Treatment Action Campaign (TAC) to allow them to communicate more easily with their 18 000 members (of which 16 000 have a cellphone, while only 600 have an email address).

Despite the concerns raised by SADAG about 'online' counselling, CellLife also plans to tap into the existing and hugely popular South African based instant messaging system, MXit, to provide cellphone based counselling for people living with or affected by Aids. This would be similar to the Dr Maths service already on MXit, where high school learners can send a MXit message to a maths tutor, and immediately receive feedback for help with their homework. In fact, researchers found that teens using this service often attempted to develop a social relationship with the anonymous Dr Maths, often logging just to say hello, or asking for counseling, even though tutors were prohibited from asking or answering personal questions (Butgereit, 2007). An earlier study among adolescent girls (Bosch, 2008) has shown the prevalence of MXit and how youth use cellphones to navigate and make sense of various

aspects of their lives, including peer and parental relations, self-representation and identity formation.

### Discussion

What this brief exploratory discussion shows is that cellphones are on the rise in South Africa, and that they are already been used in interesting ways in the field of health. But of course, critiques of the so-called ‘modernization’ paradigm are well documented. Despite this, many international agencies (and sometimes local NGOs) continue to promote information and communication technologies (ICTs) in Africa, often seeing these as a solution to development problems. But many authors (see for example Alzouma, 2005) have argued that this techno-centrist approach ignores local social conditions and incorrectly assumes that access to ICTs will leapfrog people into a technological world of economic opportunity.

Perhaps not surprisingly, cellphones are often perceived in a different light, and several argue that the increasing penetration of cellphones *can* promote development, particularly in their use to coordinate and mobilize demonstrations.

As Benjamin argues,

Most of the discourse around these new technologies is assuming that they are almost obviously beneficial. And the whole dynamic is of the digital divide, that the only problem is that people don’t enough cellphones or computers or websites and so the problem is to get websites and computers into rural villages. I don’t agree with that at all. The majority of the products I’ve seen are quite naively just pushing the technology out there (Benjamin, interview, 14/6/08).

Benjamin argues for a different approach to Castell’s network society, based on a Freirian approach, for which he has coined the phrase, ‘informatics of the oppressed’.

If the overwhelming ideology is that you plug in and absorb other people’s content, CNN, Hollywood, BBC... then in exactly the same way that Freire said, the answer isn’t rejecting information networking, but is to base it on knowledge, experience and values of the people. So what we’re trying to do is seeing if we can get people using these systems to exactly the principles of conscientization, to reflect upon their experiences, reflect their views and link to people with similar views to together develop knowledge, rather than just knowledge absorbing what the latest Hollywood film is (Benjamin, interview, 14/6/08).



Certainly, the rise of cellphone activism in South Africa demonstrates the potential usefulness of the medium, as an expression of Benjamin's informatics of the oppressed. During the recent xenophobic attacks around the country, an SMS line was set up by a coalition of NGOs to allow South Africans to express opposition to the attacks, donate money or to report an attack. Community activist, Mark Weinberg who was involved in this project, explains, they were receiving a lot of SMS messages and calls from cellphones during this period, and the "Say no to xenophobia" SMS line was a natural extension of this cellphone communication.

Cellphones are an immensely popular medium of communication amongst the working class and the poor. There are two contradictory tendencies. One is that it's by far the most democratic form of communication we've ever had – everyone owns and controls one [a cellphone] ...while at the same time we've got this crazy monopoly situation with 3 or 4 countries that control the infrastructure and make these outrageous prices. Cellphones at the moment are prohibitively expensive to make them your primary means of communicating and accessing information.

One might assume that the use of cellphones in health may become an extension these kinds of mobile community activism, particularly as convergence allows for increasingly interesting and useful applications, which might include using cellphones to access radio signals or even the internet. In addition, cellphones offer relative privacy within the context of high stigma associated with diseases such as HIV and AIDS, they have already diffused widely among the population; they are relatively cheap and accessible, and they are already being used informally for support and information sharing.

However, what is missing from the debate is the notion that the 'medium' might *not* be the 'message' (to paraphrase McLuhan's famous conjecture). The major challenges for health communication in Africa remain the same, and to simply these one might reduce it to the so-called KAP gap, or the gap between knowledge, attitudes and behaviour. And as such, there appears to be little empirical evidence to demonstrate the utility of technology,

cellphones included, in health communication. At a basic level, the main challenges in the field are increasing knowledge about a specific health issue, changing a target audience's attitude towards a positive orientation, and adopting a specific practice or changing behaviour and adopting the desired practice, which could be anything from using a condom to learning how to correctly treat water for drinking. The long-term challenge in the field is closing the gap between knowledge and attitudes. Whatever the chosen medium, the communication challenges will remain the same. As Benjamin says,

Cellphones, in particular automated systems, SMS or others, are pathetic at behaviour change, they just can't do it. It's close to laughable to think that someone will choose not to have unprotected sex if they're slightly drunk or under pressure on a Friday night because they get a beep and see 160 characters, that just doesn't happen. Particularly the automated systems are useful if people already want the information. So if people are requesting the information for example "I need a test, where do I go", or "I'm worried about this symptom, could it be Aids". If people are requesting information, cellphones are great. If you're talking about behaviour change, they're pathetic (interview, 14/6/08).

Moreover, there are no clear indicators as to whether the delivery medium has any impact on health outcomes or audience responses. Kaplan (2006) has argued that the overall lack of well designed, randomized clinical trials with economic evaluation to confirm or refute clinical and economic benefits with mobile phone/healthcare interventions is an evidence gap that should be addressed in a systematic way. In other words, the message is still most important. Some research also seems to indicate that the mass media is not the primary factor in behaviour change, but that it is rather opinion leaders (who consume mass media messages), who are most instrumental in placing health issues on communities' agendas and thus endorsing or promoting behaviour change. As Manji (2008) similarly argues, while cellphones offer many new opportunities and tools, people are the resource most central to development, and cellphones should thus be seen useful as only one part of a strategy in which people are prioritised, a sentiment echoed by Green.

It's not about the technology...it's about the people sitting at our call centre, those DOTS [Directly Observed Treatment for TB] workers. If we send a text message from the SIMPill system to a DOTS worker, who's a very poorly paid community worker; if they take the message and they delete it then we've failed. If they take the message and say someone that I'm getting my R390 a month or whatever is in trouble, and goes to that person's house, the system works. So the weakest link is always the people and not the technology (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

Another area that needs further research is the cultural implications of cellphone usage. As Kaplan (2006) aptly points out, the premise of cellphones for development is based on the developed world model of personal cellphone ownership, which may not be culturally transferable to the developing world where shared mobile telephone use is important. But in South Africa, the popularity and wide penetration of cellphones (and individual uses thereof) seems a clear indicator that it may be the new mass medium through which to reach potential audiences with health related information and messages target at pro-social behaviour.

The successful rise of online banking via cellphones for sectors of the population unable to access the internet, is only one indicator of a new cellphone culture here. While there will always be financial and regulatory barriers, with buy-in needed from government and regulatory reforms required for proper operation of basic and value-added telecommunications services if mobile telecommunications are to be used for healthcare initiatives (Kaplan 2006), without championing the modernization paradigm, it is clear that cellphones could be one way to reach large numbers of people, particularly youth.

But there are obviously still several disadvantages. The major one is that those who will receive any kind of cellphone messages will need to opt-in and subscribe, which might mean that those who really need the information are bypassed, with those already on the steps to behaviour change being the only ones receiving the information. There are also still some technical challenges, the main of these being that people can't charge their cellphones in rural areas. While the technology exists in the form of solar powered chargers, these are not freely available in Africa. Some have found was around this, such as using car batteries to charge

their phones, but this is still fairly limited. There also appears to be a trend of single and limited pilot projects and more extensive piloting is required, together with economic modelling in order to determine the benefits of the health sector embarking on larger implementation (Spur, 2005). The main reason for this is that while there is government policy to roll out pilot projects, once a project is tested, an often lengthy and expensive tender process is followed (Shackleton, 2007).

Other infrastructural challenges include lack of consistency in the national health arena, with health information systems varying widely between provinces and health institutions. As a result, even though the Department of Health's National Antiretroviral Treatment guidelines call for the use of technology to promote adherence (Shackleton, 2007), South Africa public sector institutions largely engage with mobile solutions in an isolated and case-specific manner. There is no comprehensive strategy guiding choice around the use of mobile technology, which results in these limited full-scale implementations (White & Patel, 2005).

And from the perspective of economics, these kinds of interventions, while relatively cheap or free to the user, can be costly to the NGO or service provider. More work is needed to persuade cellphone service providers and networks to partner existing projects.

I know first hand...that the incremental costs of carrying an SMS on the networks is zero cents. So every single cent that the network charges you to carry an SMS is, after overhead, pure profit...they're making millions and I certainly believe there's an opportunity for them as well as government to come to the party. I'm currently paying 22 cents per message and internationally we send out a million per day" (interview, David Green, 27/ 06/ 08).

Despite these challenges, cellphones are emerging in South Africa as a widespread and popular technology; and as such, it seems likely that they will be successfully applied both in the provision of healthcare, as well as in messaging and communication campaigns. Cellphone based services may not necessarily be more successful on their own, but together

with other media may help in the provision of effective multimedia campaigns.

## References

- African Telecommunication/ICT Indicators (2008). Available online at <http://www.comminet.com/redirect.cgi?cimo=1&r=http://www.itu.int/ITU-D/ict/publications/africa/2008/index.html> ). Retrieved 20 June 2008.
- Alzouma, G. (2005). Myths of digital technology in Africa. *Global Media and Communication*, 1(3): 339-356.
- Bosch, T. (2008). Wots ur ASLR? Adolescent girls' use of MXit in Cape Town. *Commonwealth Journal of Youth Studies* 6 (2).
- Butgereit, L. (2007), 'Math on MXit: Using MXit as a Medium for Mathematics Education', Meraka INNOVATE Conference for Educators, CSIR, Pretoria, 18-20 April 2007, pp 13, Retrieved on March 28, 2008 from [http://researchspace.csircoza/dspace/bitstream/10204/1614/1/Butgereit\\_2007.pdf](http://researchspace.csircoza/dspace/bitstream/10204/1614/1/Butgereit_2007.pdf)
- Buys, P. et al (2008). Determinants of a digital divide in sub-Saharan Africa: A spatial econometric analysis of cell phone coverage. Policy Research Working Paper 4516. The World Bank.
- Chakraborty, S. (2008). Mobile phones bridging the information divide; Issues and lessons from Africa. Available online at [http://ww.unc.edu/~sayanc/globalcomm/Africa-mobile\\_phones.pdf](http://ww.unc.edu/~sayanc/globalcomm/Africa-mobile_phones.pdf)
- Article retrieved June 19, 2008

Comminit, 2003. The Compliance Service uses SMS Technology for TB Treatment.

Available online at <http://www.comminit.com/en/node/147683>. Article retrieved 19-

Jun-08.

Curioso, W. & Kurth, A. (2007). Access, use and perceptions regarding Internet, cell

phones and PDAs as a means for health promotion for people living with HIV in

Peru. Available online at <http://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?>

[articlerender.fcgi?](http://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?)  
[articlerender.fcgi?artid=2048945](http://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?). Article retrieved on 4<sup>th</sup> June 2008.

Goggin, G. (2006). Cell Phone Culture: Mobile technology in everyday life. Routledge:

London and New York.

Gray, V. (2006). The un-wired continent: Africa's mobile success story. *Economía*

*Exterior* 36

Harrison, R. (2005). AIDS project uses SMS to keep tabs on progress of patients. *The*

*Cape Times*. August 19<sup>th</sup>. Article available online at <http://www.capetimes.co.za/>

[index.php?fArticleId=2843275](http://www.capetimes.co.za/). Article retrieved June 19, 2008.

Health 24. (2008). Cell phones to track teen health. Available online at

<http://www.health24.com/news/Teens/1-950,45882.asp>. Article retrieved June 9,

2008.

Kaplan, W. (2006). Can the ubiquitous power of mobile phones be used to improve

health outcomes in developing countries? *Globalization and Health* 2(9): 1744-8603. Also available online at <http://www.globalizationandhealth.com/content/2/1/9>

Kimani, M. (2008). Better health at the click of a button. Mail and Guardian online.

Article available at [http://www.mg.co.za/articlepage.aspx?area=/insight/insight\\_\\_africa&articleid=340710](http://www.mg.co.za/articlepage.aspx?area=/insight/insight__africa&articleid=340710). Article retrieved 9 June 2008.

LaFraniere, S. (2005). Cellphones catapult rural Africa to 21<sup>st</sup> century.

LaFraniere, S. (2005). Cell phone frenzy in Africa, world's top growth market.

Available online at [http://www.signonsandiego.com/uniontrib/20050826/news\\_1n26phones.html](http://www.signonsandiego.com/uniontrib/20050826/news_1n26phones.html). Article retrieved on 20 June 2008.

Lester, R. (2006). Cell phones: Tightening the communication gap in resource-limited antiretroviral programmes? *AIDS: Official Journal of the International AIDS Society*. 20(17): 2242-2244.

Lim, M. et al. (2008). SMS STI: A review of the uses of mobile phone text messaging in sexual health. *International Journal of STD & AIDS* 19(5): 287-290.

Lindow, M. (2004). How SMS could save your life. Available online at [http://www.kiwanja.net/database/article/article\\_SMS\\_save\\_life.pdf](http://www.kiwanja.net/database/article/article_SMS_save_life.pdf)



- Manji, F. (2008). Mobile activism or mobile hype? *Gender and Media Studies Diversity Journal*, Issue 4. Available online at [http://www.genderlinks.org.za/page.php?p\\_id=303](http://www.genderlinks.org.za/page.php?p_id=303). Retrieved 27 June 2008.
- Mbarika, Victor and Mbarika, Irene. (2006). Africa calling.  
<http://www.spectrum.ieee.org/print/3426>
- McBride CM, Rimer BK: Using the telephone to improve health behavior and health service delivery. *Patient Educ Couns* 1999, 37:3-18.
- Obermayer, J. et al. (2004). College smoking-cessation using cell phone text messaging. *Journal of American College Health* 53 (2): 71-78.
- Oh, H. et al. (2005). What is eHealth: A Systematic Review of Published Definitions. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, 7(1). Available online at <http://www.jmir.org/2005/1/e1/>. Retrieved 29 June 2008.
- Puccio, J. et al. (2006). The use of cell phone reminder calls for assisting HIV-Infected adolescents and young adults to adhere to highly active antiretroviral therapy: A pilot study. *AIDS Patient Care and STDs*. 20(6): 438-444.
- Rheingold, H. (2002). *Smart Mobs: The next social revolution*. Cambridge, MA: Perseus Books/ Basic Books.
- Shackleton, S. (2007). Rapid assessment of cell phones for development.

Commissioned by UNICEF. Available online at

[http://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF\\_resources\\_cellphones4dev.pdf](http://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_resources_cellphones4dev.pdf).

Retrieved 27 June 2008.

Siegel, M. & Biener, L. (2000). The impact of an antismoking media campaign on progression to established smoking: Results of a longitudinal youth study. *American Journal of Public Health* 90 (3): 380-386.

Soto, R. et al. (2006). Communication in critical care environments: Mobile telephones improve patient care. *Anesthesia and Analgesia*.

Spur, N. (2005). Mainstreaming ICTs. Available online at

[http://www.womensnet.org.za/publications/mainstreaming\\_ICTs/Introduction.htm](http://www.womensnet.org.za/publications/mainstreaming_ICTs/Introduction.htm). Retrieved 26-Jun-08.

Tachakra, S. et al. (2003). Mobile e-health: The unwired evolution of telemedicine. *Telemedicine Journal and e-Health*.

The Economist, (2008). A world of witness. April 10<sup>th</sup>. Available online at

[http://www.economist.com/surveys/displaystory.cfm?story\\_id=10950499](http://www.economist.com/surveys/displaystory.cfm?story_id=10950499).

Retrieved April 17, 2008.

The Soul Beat Issue 109: Mobile Phones for Social Change in Africa. June 25 2008.

Available online at <http://www.comminit.com/en/africa/experiences.html>.

Retrieved 27 June 2008.

Verclas, K. (2007). Cell Phones in Health: UNICEF and Women's Net Report on South Africa. October 20. Available online at <http://mobileactive.org/cell-phones-health-unice>. Article retrieved 19 June 2008.

Vidrine, D. et al. (2006). A randomized trial of a proactive cellular telephone intervention for smokers living with HIV/ AIDS. AIDS: Official Journal of the International AIDS Society. 20 (2): 253:260.

White, G. & Patel, I. (2005). M-government: South African approaches and experiences. Centre for Public Service Innovation. Available online at [http://www.mgovernment.org/resurces/euromgov2005/PDF/32\\_R374IP.pdf](http://www.mgovernment.org/resurces/euromgov2005/PDF/32_R374IP.pdf). Article retrieved June 27th 2008.